



Note: Staff reports can be accessed at www.mncppc.org/pgco/planning/plan.htm

DETAILED SITE PLAN

DSP-02007

Application	General Data	
Project Name MARY CATHERINE ESTATES	Date Accepted	02/07/2002
	Planning Board Action Limit	04/18/2002
	ZHE Hearing Date	NA
Location OFF MARY CATHERINE DRIVE, NORTHWEST OF PISCATAWAY ROAD AT THE SOUTHWEST END OF CLAVIER PLACE	Plan Acreage	8.69 Acres
	Zone	R-R
	Dwelling Units	15
Applicant/Address ROY RIDGEWAY 3082 FESTIVAL WAY WALDORF, MD 20601	Square Footage	NA
	Planning Area	81B
	Council District	09
	Municipality	NA
	200-Scale Base Map	215SE03

Purpose of Application	Notice Dates	
CONSTRUCTION OF 15 SINGLE-FAMILY HOMES	Adjoining Property Owners (CB-15-1998)	01/28/2002
	Previous Parties of Record (CB-13-1997)	03/11/2002
	Sign(s) Posted on Site	03/22/2002
	Variance(s): Adjoining Property Owners	NA

Staff Recommendation			Staff Reviewer: ZHANG
APPROVAL	APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS	DISAPPROVAL	DISCUSSION
	X		

July 30, 2009

MEMORANDUM

TO: Prince George's County Planning Board

VIA: Steve Adams, Urban Design Supervisor

FROM: Henry Zhang, Urban Design Section, Development Review Division

SUBJECT: Detailed Site Plan, DSP-02007, Mary Catherine Estates
Type II Tree Conservation Plan, TCPII/147/01-01

The Urban Design staff has reviewed the Detailed Site Plan for the subject property and presents the following evaluation and findings leading to a recommendation of APPROVAL with conditions as described in the Recommendation section of this report.

EVALUATION

This Detailed Site Plan was reviewed and evaluated for compliance with the following criteria:

- a. The requirements of the Zoning Ordinance
- b. The requirements of Zoning Map Amendment A-9932
- c. The requirements of Preliminary Plan of Subdivision 4-98075 and Final Plat 5-01022
- d. The requirements of the *Landscape Manual*
- e. The requirements of the Prince George's County Woodland Conservation Ordinance
- f. Referral comments

FINDINGS

Based upon the evaluation and analysis of the subject Detailed Site Plan, the Urban Design Review staff recommends the following findings:

1. Request: The subject application is for approval of a Detailed Site Plan for 15 single-family detached houses in the R-R zone.
2. Location: The site is located in Planning Area 81B, Council District 9. It is situated specifically on the west side of Piscataway Road, south of Clavier Place and Zareh Drive.
3. Surroundings and Use: The subject site is bounded on the southeast by Piscataway Road. To the northeast and northwest of the property is the existing Mary Catherine Estates Subdivision in the R-R Zone. To the southwest of the property are single-family residential

uses in the R-E Zone. An R-E-zoned rectangular lot wedges into the subject property in a perpendicular way along the frontage of Piscataway Road.

4. Previous Approvals: The subject property was recommended for residential land use at a low suburban density (up to 2.6 dwellings per acre) by the 1993 Subregion V Master Plan. The 1993 Subregion V SMA classified this property in the R-E Zone. The subject property was subsequently rezoned to the R-R Zone by Zoning Map Amendment A-9932, which was approved in 1997.

The subject site has a previously approved Preliminary Plan of Subdivision, 4-98075 (Lots 1-16, Block L), which includes a Type I Tree Conservation Plan (TCPI/75/97) and a Stormwater Management Concept Plan #948003310. A Type II Tree Conservation Plan (TCPII/147/01) was approved in 2001 for road grading. On August 8, 2000, a new Stormwater Management Concept Plan #8003310-1994-01 was approved that supersedes the previous approval.

5. Site Plan Data:(As proposed by the applicant)

Zone	R-R (Rural Residential)
Existing Use	Single-family Detached Dwelling
Proposed Use	Single-family Detached Dwelling
Number of Lots Permitted	18 Lots
Number of Proposed Lots	15 Lots
Lot Area	8.69 Acres

Architectural Model Data:

Model	Square Footage (Sq. Ft.)	Building Height (Ft.)
Avalon	2,867	26.5
Courtland	2,907	29.5
Highgrove	3,653	26.5
Savoy	1,944	26.5
Victoria	2,439	26.5
Waverly	3,189	26.5
Yorkshire	2,508	26.5
Zachary	2,249	26.8

6. Design Features: The subject site has been denied access from Piscataway Road by A-9932. Piscataway Road is a designated historic road; access was denied in order to minimize the negative impact that might be generated by this development on the historic road and adjacent properties. The site is connected to the existing Mary Catherine Estates Subdivision by the extension of the stubbed Clavier Place. Clavier Place is further connected to Lauer Court, which ends as a cul-de-sac road. The proposed 15 lots are distributed along Clavier Place and Lauer Court.

Eight architectural models have been proposed by Ryan Homes for this development. They are Avalon, Courtland, Highgrove, Savoy, Victoria, Waverly, Yorkshire and Zachary. The facade design of the proposed models is a stylistic mixture that makes use of architectural details of different inspirations but mainly from the Colonial style. The eight models have

two-story, five-bay main buildings with linear plans and accentuated front doors. Most of the proposed elevations have double front-entrance garages as an attached unit.

The proposed roof patterns of most models are combinations of gabled and cross-gabled roof segments. Some of the elevations have hipped roofs and still others have decorative elements such as dentil mouldings and roof dormers. Brick, vinyl and stucco are the dominant proposed exterior building materials. A few elevations have quoin corner treatment. A uniform fenestration pattern has been proposed for all elevations.

Most of the front entrance doors are pedimented six-panel colonial doors with either transom, fanlight or glass sidelight. Door pediments are usually mounted on Colonial pilasters. Popular door pediments are in the form of rams head, elliptical arch with keystone, sunburst, acorn or plain headpiece. Other common design treatments which are used to emphasize the front entrance are protruded cross-gable pavilion and entrance porch.

Rear elevations are less decorative compared with the above-discussed front elevations. Cross gable, Palladian window, single, paired or triple sash windows, casement windows, patio door, decorative trim, fascia and frieze are the common elements on the proposed rear elevations. All the proposed side elevations have a minimum of two architectural features.

COMPLIANCE WITH EVALUATION CRITERIA:

7. Zoning Ordinance: The subject application has been reviewed for compliance with the requirements in the R-R Zone and the site plan design guidelines of the Zoning Ordinance.
 - a. The subject application is in conformance with the requirements of Section 27-441(b), which governs permitted uses in residential zones. The proposed single-family detached dwelling is a permitted use in the R-R Zone.
 - b. The proposal is also in conformance with the requirements of Section 27-442, Regulations, regarding net lot area, lot coverage and green area, lot/width frontage, yards, building height and density.
8. Zoning Map Amendment, A-9932: Zoning Map Amendment A-9932 rezoned the subject property from the R-E Zone to the R-R Zone with the following conditions:
 - 1. *If either Zareh Drive or Clavier Place is opened to the subject property, access to Piscataway Road is denied for subdivision and development of the site, except for construction access.*
 - 2. *The style, quality and building materials (brick) of the houses shall be consistent with that of the houses in the adjacent area of Mary Catherine Estates.●*

Staff Comments: The subject application satisfies the above-noted Condition 1. The access to the proposed development is from the existing Mary Catherine Drive. No access to the development is proposed from Piscataway Road.

The existing Mary Catherine Estates is a well-established single-family detached subdivision. Houses in the subdivision are mainly two-story brick buildings with various architectural treatments, such as gabled and cross-gabled roof, shuttered windows, pedimented entrance door, decorative windows on gable wall, etc. The proposed eight architectural models for the subject application are in general conformance with the existing Mary Catherine Estates in terms of style and quality. The eight models have three types of exterior materials, brick, vinyl and stucco. The existing buildings use brick as the dominant building material. Most of the houses have brick on all four sides. Thus the building material of the proposed models is not consist with the adjacent houses.

9. Preliminary Plan of Subdivision, 4-98075 and Final Plat, 5-01022: The Preliminary Plan of Subdivision for the subject property was approved by the Prince George's County Planning Board on February 4, 1999, subject to 12 conditions. Condition 3 is specifically applicable to this Detailed Site Plan application.

- 3. **Prior to the issuance of permits, a limited detailed site plan shall be approved. This site plan shall examine compatibility with surrounding homes and techniques for and adequacy of buffering proposed homes on lots fronting Piscataway Road.**

Staff Comments: The subject site plan is submitted in order to satisfy the requirements of Condition 3. The site plan has been reviewed specifically for its compatibility with the existing subdivision in terms of style, quality and building materials of the proposed models and the buffering techniques on Lots 10, which has a rear yard oriented toward Piscataway Road. The Urban Design staff finds that the proposed site plan complies with Condition 3 of the Preliminary Plan of Subdivision, 4-98075, except for the exterior building material of the proposed models.

The Final Plat of the subject site that was recorded in CH 191 @63 contains 6 notes. Notes 2 and 3 are applicable to the subject application.

- 2. **Direct access from this subdivision to Piscataway Road is denied.**
- 3. **Prior to issuance of permits, a limited detailed site plan shall be approved. This site plan shall examine compatibility with surrounding homes and techniques for and adequacy of buffering proposed homes on lots fronting Piscataway Road.**

Staff Comments: The site plan is in substantial conformance with the record plat. The Detailed Site Plan complies with Note 2 by providing a new driveway to Lot 10 from Lauer Court. Except for building materials, the models proposed in the subject Detailed Site Plan are consistent with that of homes in the adjacent area of Mary Catherine Estates in building style and quality.

10. Landscape Manual: The proposed subdivision of 15-lot, single-family detached homes is subject to the requirements of Section 4.1, Residential Requirements, and Section 4.6, Buffering Residential Development from Streets, of the *Landscape Manual*.

- a. Section 4.1, Residential Requirements
The lot area of the proposed 15 lots range from 20,000 square feet to 34,062 square feet, which fall into the *Landscape Manual* category of larger than 20,000 square feet but less than 40,000 square feet. Per Section 4.1(b), each lot shall be planted with a minimum of three major shade trees and two ornamental or evergreen trees. The proposed Landscape Plan complies with the above noted requirements.
- b. Section 4.6, Buffering Residential Development from Streets
Section 4.6 requires that when the rear yards of one-family detached dwellings in any zone are oriented toward a collector or any arterial street, a buffer area shall be provided between the dwellings and the public right-of-way. Lot 10 in the proposed subdivision is oriented toward the cul-de-sac of Lauer Court and has its rear yard fronting to Piscataway Road, which is an arterial road with a right-of-way of 120 feet. According to the requirements of Section 4.6, a minimum 50-foot- wide buffer area is required and is to be planted with 6 shade trees, 18 evergreen trees and 40 shrubs per 100 linear feet of right-of-way.

The Landscape Plan does show an approximately 50-foot-wide wooded area, which consists mainly of the existing woodland and is labeled as a tree preservation area, between the building on Lot 10 and ultimate right-of-way line of Piscataway Road. But it fails to clearly indicate how the requirements of Section 4.6 will be met.

The existing Lot 11 is currently oriented toward and accessed through Piscataway Road. The development of the subject site will deny access to Lot 11 directly from Piscataway Road, according to Condition 9 of Preliminary Plan of Subdivision 4-98075. A new driveway from Lauer Court and a 30-foot-wide bufferyard along Piscataway Road have been proposed on the site plan for this lot. The treatments for Lot 11 comport with notes on the Final Plat. If Lot 11 is ever redeveloped in the future in such a manner that the rear yard of the new building will be oriented to Piscataway Road, then additional landscaped buffer per Section 4.6 of the *Landscape Manual* should be provided.

- 11. Woodland Conservation Ordinance: The property is subject to the provisions of the Prince George's County Woodland Conservation Ordinance because a Type I Tree Conservation Plan, TCPI/75/97, was previously approved by the Planning Board on February 4, 1999. A Type II Tree Conservation Plan, TCPII/147/01, was later approved for rough grading of Clavier Place and Lauer Court.
 - a. A simplified Forest Stand Delineation (FSD) was submitted with the Preliminary Plan of Subdivision, 4-98075, and found by the Environmental Planning staff to address the requirements for an FSD in accordance with the Prince George's County Woodland Conservation and Tree Preservation Technical Manual.
 - b. The revised Type II Tree Conservation Plan, TCPII/147/01, submitted with this Detailed Site Plan application was inconsistent with the applicable regulations. During the review process, the applicant made revisions to TCPII/14/01 according to the referral comments of the Environmental Planning Section. The second submittal was reviewed by the staff and it was found that there are still several unresolved technical issues with the revised TCPII. The Environmental Planning

staff recommends approval of TCPII subject to conditions as stated in the Recommendation section of this report.

12. Referral Comments: The subject application was referred to all concerned agencies and divisions. Major referral comments are summarized as follows:

- a. In a memorandum dated March 18 , 2002, the State Highway Administration had no objection to the approval of Detailed Site Plan DSP-02007, Mary Catherine Estates.
- b. The Community Planning Division, in a memorandum dated March 12, 2002, made the following determinations:

■ Piscataway Road, is planned to be upgraded to a four- to six-lane arterial highway, A-54. It is also designated as a historic road. Only two lots in the subdivision have much exposure to Piscataway Road.

■ ■ Lot 10 is proposed for new construction oriented away from Piscataway Road with a wooded area retained along right-of-way. Is the character of the preserved woodland sufficient to retain the historic character and buffer the roadway? Does additional vegetation need to be added?

■ ■ Lot 11 appears to be developed with a previously existing home oriented to Piscataway Road; it could be reoriented or redeveloped with orientation to Lauer Court instead. If redevelopment occurs, additional landscaping/buffering should be added along the Piscataway Road right-of-way.

■ Pursuant to a condition of zoning, the ■ style, quality and building materials (brick) • for the houses proposed in this subdivision should be reviewed for consistency with that of the houses in the adjacent area of Mary Catherine Estates. •

Staff Comment: Both the Sectional Map Amendment and 1993 Subregion V Master Plan emphasize the harmony of housing styles and materials between the existing and proposed developments in the area and preservation of Piscataway Road as a historic road from the adverse impact of future developments. Buffering techniques such as landscaping, open space, and attractive fencing are listed as the site planning solutions for the developments in the vicinity. The Preliminary Plan of Subdivision for the subject property required a 60-foot dedication from the center line of Piscataway Road as one of the conditions attached to the approval of Preliminary Plan of Subdivision 4-98075 for the subject property. The Detailed Site

Plan complies with this condition.

The building on Lot 10 is sited approximately 70 feet from the boundary of the 60-foot dedication. Within the 70-foot setback, the applicant proposes a minimum of 40-foot-wide tree conservation buffer area along the entire frontage of the subject property fronting Piscataway Road, which substantially screens the proposed development from the historic road. But to the east and northeast of Lot 10 is an existing single-family house in the R-E Zone which is not included in the subject application. This adjacent site is open and barely landscaped. The entire east side of Lot 10 is totally visible from Piscataway Road. Meanwhile, the staff visited the site and found that the existing wooded area on Lot 10 consists mainly of mature trees. Because of insufficient undergrowth, the screening effect of the existing woodland is limited. The intent of the master plan and SMA has not been sufficiently served. Additional buffering treatments along the north and east of Lot 10 are needed.

- c. The Transportation Planning Section, in a memorandum dated February 27, 2002, offered the following comments:

■Based on the above analyses, the Transportation Planning Section concludes that the proposed Detailed Site Plan as submitted will not substantially impair the integrity of any existing or planned transportation facilities in the vicinity of the subject site. •

In a separate memorandum from the Transportation Planning Section dated February 28, 2002, on Detailed Site Plan Review for Master Plan Trail Compliance, the Trails Planner noted that there are no master plan trails issues with this Detailed Site Plan application.

- d. The Permit Review Section, in a memorandum dated February 25, 2002, asked two technical questions concerning compliance of the subject Detailed Site Plan application with the requirements of the design guidelines and regulations of the Zoning Ordinance. These questions have been addressed in the review process.
- e. In a memorandum dated February 27, 2002, the Subdivision Section staff found that the proposed site plan is in substantial conformance with the approved preliminary plan and record plat. The staff noted that of the six notes contained in the plat, three are applicable to the subject application:

■Note 1 requires development to be in conformance with the Type I Tree Conservation Plan. The Environmental Planning Section should review the plan for such conformance.

■Note 2 denies direct access to Piscataway Road. It is unclear from the submitted Site Plan whether Lot 11 is included in this review. Lot 11 contains the existing house which will remain. Access is shown from this home to Piscataway Road. This note was required by Condition 9 of Preliminary Plan approval. The condition was based on two factors. First, the property was rezoned to the R-R Zone via Zoning Map

Amendment A-9932. That approval contained a condition to deny access to Piscataway Road if Clavier Place were opened to the subject property. • Second, Piscataway Road is a designated historic road. The applicant proposed a 60-foot-wide buffer of woodlands and reforestation area along Piscataway Road at the rear of Lots 10 and 11. Access is clearly denied even to Lot 11. Therefore, the DSP should be revised to clearly include Lot 11, with a driveway from Lauer Court.

■Note 3 requires approval of a detailed site plan prior to the issuance of building permits. This was based on two factors as well. First, the rezoning approval included the following condition:

■The style, quality and building materials (brick) of the houses shall be consistent with that of the houses in the adjacent area of Mary Catherine Estates.

■The plat note requires the detailed site plan to ensure conformance with this condition and to ensure the adequacy of buffering along Piscataway Road. The Urban Design Section should examine these issues carefully. •

Staff Comment: Zoning Map Amendment A-9932 raised two concerns which are specifically related to the subject site about access to Piscataway Road and the style, quality and building materials (brick) of the houses of the subject development. Based on the conditions of A-9932, a Detailed Site Plan review was mandated by the approval of Preliminary Plan of Subdivision for this property. Final plat approval further carried on the conditions. The proposed Detailed Site Plan proposes an indirect access to Piscataway Road via Claver Place and Mary Catherine Drive. The Detailed Site Plan complies with the access condition.

Per condition 4 of the Preliminary Plan of Subdivision, which dictates a dedication of 60 feet from the center line of Piscataway Road, the Detailed Site Plan proposes the required dedication. At the same time, the site plan also locates the building more than 70 feet from the ultimate right-of-way on the lot that fronts Piscataway Road. Within the 70-foot setback, a 40-foot tree preservation strip has been established. But due to insufficient undergrowth, the screening effect of the preservation strip is limited. Additional buffering is still required in order to sufficiently screen the development from Piscataway Road.

The subject Detailed Site Plan application proposes eight architectural models for this development. The Urban Design staff reviewed the proposed architectural models and concluded that the architecture is consistent in terms of style, quality and building materials with that of the houses in the adjacent Mary Catherine Estates Subdivision if the revisions proposed by staff have been made.

- f. This Detailed Site Plan application was also referred to the WSSC. In a memorandum dated January 31, 2002, the

staff noted that the project will be sufficiently served by the water and sewer system.

- g. In a memorandum dated February 25, 2002, the Environmental Planning Section found insufficient information and several deficiencies with the application. The staff noted that:

■The Environmental Planning Section has reviewed the above referenced Detailed Site Plan, as accepted on February 7, 2002, and finds that plan revisions and additional information are required. The Environmental Planning Section reserves the right to comment on plan revisions and additional information submitted for review. •

Staff Comments: The applicant has revised the TCPII according to the referral comments of the Environmental Planning Section. The revised plan has been resubmitted during the review process. The Environmental Planning Section staff in a separate memorandum regarding the revised TCPII dated April 2, 2002, concluded that the revised plan generally addresses the issues identified in the previous memorandum. The staff recommends the approval of the Type II Tree Conservation Plan, TCPII/147/01-01, subject to conditions which have been incorporated into the Recommendation section of this report.

- h. In a memorandum dated February 13, 2002, the Department of Environmental Resources/Concept found no issues with the Detailed Site Plan application. The staff states that:

■The site plan for Mary Catherine Estates, DSP-02007 is consistent with technically approved stormwater plan #8003310-1994. •

- i. The application was also referred to the Department of Public Works and Transportation of Prince George's County. In a memorandum dated February 20, 2002, the staff offered the following comments:

■Coordination with the Maryland State Highway Administration is necessary. Extension of Clavier Place, in accordance with the Department of Public Works and Transportation's Specifications and Standards, are required.

■All improvements within the public right-of-way, as dedicated to the County, are to be in accordance with the County Road Ordinance, DPW&T's Specifications and Standards and Americans with Disabilities Act. •

- j. The Detailed Site Plan was also referred to the Historic Preservation Section,

Community Planning Division. In a memorandum dated March 13, 2002, the Historic Preservation staff indicated that no historic properties will be affected by this development.

13. The Detailed Site Plan, if revised in accordance with the proposed conditions, will represent a reasonable alternative for satisfying the site design guidelines without requiring unreasonable costs and without detracting substantially from the utility of the proposed development for its intended uses.

RECOMMENDATION

Based upon the foregoing evaluation and analysis, the Urban Design staff recommends that the Planning Board adopt the findings of this report and APPROVE Detailed Site Plan DSP-02007, Mary Catherine Estates, and Type II Tree Conservation Plan TCPH/147/01-01 subject to the following conditions:

1. Prior to certificate approval of Detailed Site Plan DSP-02007, the applicant shall make the following revisions to the Detailed Site Plan, Landscape Plan and Type II Tree Conservation Plan:
 - a. Provide additional buffer strips of varied width, consisting mainly of evergreen trees and shrubs on Lot 10 along the northern boundary of the existing wooded area adjacent to Piscataway Road, and along the eastern property line to screen the rear yard of the adjacent existing property from Lot 10, for review and approval by the designee of the Planning Board.
 - b. Provide the required Section 4.6 landscape schedule for Lot 10 in order to be in full compliance with the requirements of the *Landscape Manual*.
 - c. Indicate in the site plan notes all the applicable zoning regulations regarding setback, building coverage, green area, etc., per Section 27-442.
 - d. Either remove all Woodland Conservation Areas from Lots 6, 7, and 8; and revise the Woodland Conservation Worksheet to include the clearing of all woodlands on Lots 6, 7, and 8; and provide the additional Woodland Conservation requirements due to the clearing as off-site mitigation at a site to be determined prior to the

issuance of any new permits; OR revise the TCPII to show the Woodland Conservation Tree Save Area on Lots 6,7 and 8 as a Woodland Conservation Selective Clearing/Reforestation Area. If the Woodland Conservation Selective Clearing/Reforestation Area option is used, the plan details for the selective clearing, the reforestation at the density of no less than 12 one-inch caliper trees per lot, and the required reforestation notes shall be provided on the plan.

- e. Revise the Woodland Conservation Worksheet to change the fee-in-lieu to off-site mitigation at a site to be determined prior to the issuance of any additional permits.
 - f. Revise the plan tabulation table and the Woodland Conservation Worksheet to include all woodlands that are saved but not counted toward meeting the requirements as being cleared. The plan shall include a shading pattern and labels for the areas preserved but counted as cleared. Also, revise the table to include a row for Clavier Place and Lauer Court and add a column to the table for the areas of existing woodland and areas of woodland cleared.
- 2. All units shall have brick on all four sides. No two units located next to or across the street from each other may have identical front elevations. No hipped roof is allowed in the development.
 - 3. The Highgrove Model on Lot 14 shall have on its side elevations a minimum of three architectural features in a reasonably balanced composition. The side and rear elevations of this model shall have the same style paneled shutters as those on the front elevation on all windows wherever it is possible.
 - 4. The developer, his heirs, successors and/or assignees shall display in the sales office all of the plans approved by the Planning Board for this subdivision, including all exterior elevations of all approved models, the Detailed Site Plan and Landscape Plan, in order to ensure that prospective purchasers in this subdivision are made aware of the plans approved by the Planning Board.